Abstract
A seven-day project with fourth grade social studies classes to allow students to research Du Bois and Washington’s beliefs about the best policies to address civil rights issues at the beginning of the 20th century. This approach to teaching divergent solutions to public policies enables elementary students to analyze differing policy solutions.

Introduction
Elementary students need meaningful opportunities to explore public issues that they will grapple with as future democratic citizens. They should examine how a historical figure’s solution to an issue is often rooted in his or her economic, cultural, political, religious, and regional values, biases, and beliefs (Oliver & Shaver, 1966). Students’ ability to research and analyze politicians, special interest groups, and notable public figures’ policy solutions equips them with the knowledge to make informed decisions that are steeped in evidence (Engle & Ochoa, 1988). One historical topic that begs this approach is the conflicting civil rights solutions offered by Booker T. Washington (1856-1915) and W.E.B. Du Bois (1868-1963) in the early part of the 20th century.

In this article, we discuss a seven-day project implemented with a fourth grade social studies class in a large metropolitan area within the Southeast. The teacher integrated primary and secondary sources to allow her students to examine Du Bois and Washington’s beliefs about the best policies to address civil rights issues. This approach to teaching divergent solutions to public policies enables elementary students to weigh the merits and limitations of policy solutions (Ochoa-Becker, 1996). In the next sections, we discuss the steps and resources utilized for each day in this project.

Day One: Elementary Students Analyze Booker T. Washington’s Policies
On day one, students analyzed Booker T. Washington’s beliefs about the best ways to address civil rights issues. The teacher started by reading aloud Fifty Cents and a Dream (Asim, 2012) to the class and stopped at several points to discuss key material in this content-area picture book. This picture book communicates Washington’s strong work ethic as a passageway for freedom. His determination to learn was so intense that he journeyed 500 miles mostly on foot to get an education at Hampton University in Virginia. The teacher mentioned that Washington’s beliefs formed while trying to get to Hampton University for his education and from his experiences growing up as a slave in the rural South influenced and shaped his policies on the best ways to address racial discrimination that African Americans faced. Due to Washington’s experiences and humble beginnings, he saw the key to advancement for the African American community rooted in the economic benefits.
of learning a professional trade. Then, students in small groups examined one of the excerpts from Washington's famous *1895 Atlanta Compromise Speech* (Washington, 1895) or his autobiography that was published in 1901, *Up from Slavery* (Washington, 1901), in the graphic organizer in Appendix A.

By chunking these texts in this manner, reluctant and struggling readers can focus on the main ideas with Washington's policies. The teacher floated around the classroom to help the groups as they completed a portion of the graphic organizer. Then, there was a class debriefing. Students shared their responses and added onto their individual graphic organizers based on peers' comments. This class debriefing enabled the students to learn from peers and ended the first day. The activities the first day allowed students to analyze Booker T. Washington's values and beliefs that influenced how he constructed solutions to civil rights issues (Levstik & Barton, 2015).

**Day Two: Elementary Students Analyze W.E.B. Du Bois' Policies**

Students started day two reviewing Booker T. Washington's policies by answering the following question: According to Booker T. Washington, what was the key to addressing civil rights issues for African Americans? Students answered this question and shared their responses in a class discussion. Then, the teacher stated that some other civil rights activists disagreed with Washington's public policies, and that the most well-known of these dissenter was W.E.B. Du Bois. Students watched a clip¹ to understand why people disagreed with Washington. Then, they also viewed two short clips² to explore Du Bois' beliefs about the best ways to address civil rights issues. From these two clips, students gained an overview of Du Bois' beliefs to help them grasp how his life experiences in the Northeast and education at Harvard University caused him to view solutions to issues of racial discrimination differently than Booker T. Washington. This prepared students to work in groups to further explore Du Bois' policies on civil rights issues by reading excerpts from *Souls of Black Folk* (Du Bois, 1903). Similar to the first day, students in small groups reviewed an excerpt and answered only part of the graphic organizer found in Appendix B.

The examination of these excerpts allowed students to grasp Du Bois' beliefs about the best ways to aid the African American community by first gaining political equality. Students can also realize the reasons why Du Bois disagreed with Washington's public policies.

After groups completed a portion of this graphic organizer, there was another class discussion. Like day one, students shared their responses and added onto the graphic organizer based on peers' comments. The difference was that the teacher focused this discussion on students articulating Du Bois' beliefs while comparing them to those of Washington. This allowed the students to convey the differences of these two historical figures' views on best public policies to address the racial discrimination faced by African Americans.

**Day Three: Elementary Students Watch the Historical Play**

On day three, students watched an in-class play performance from Vulcan Park's *Birmingham History on the Road* that focused on Washington and Du Bois' beliefs about civil rights issues. The play focused on topics covered on days one and two of the project. In other words, this play reinforced content material already explored by allowing the students a creative way to observe and think about Du Bois and Washington's beliefs, values, and public policies (Turner, 2017). Dr. Clabough edited the script for this historical play to be age appropriate for fourth grade students. Excerpts from this play can be viewed at the website below. Two actors from the University of Alabama at Birmingham's drama department portrayed Du Bois and Washington and

---

²https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hpKQ9rTBo4 and https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tvE3Ft10h2w

*Ohio Social Studies Review, Volume 56, Issue 1*
argued why each man's public policies were the best ways to address civil rights issues. The play took about 30 minutes of the class period, and after the play, the fourth graders eagerly asked questions about Washington and Du Bois to the two UAB actors for the remainder of the class.

The teacher conveyed to her co-authors that multiple parents e-mailed her after school stating how much their children enjoyed the play. Students’ questions mainly focused on asking the two actors about different aspects of Du Bois and Washington's beliefs, values, and public policies. Dramatic plays like the one used here appeal to students' diverse learning needs as well as serving to actively engage them in the content material being explored (Morris, 2009; Russell, Waters, & Turner, 2017).

Day Four: Reviewing Du Bois and Washington's Public Policies

The goal of day four was for students to summarize Du Bois and Washington's beliefs about public policies with civil rights issues. Students worked in small groups to complete the graphic organizer in Appendix C and used evidence from sources examined on days one, two, and three.

The completion of this graphic organizer permitted students to articulate their understanding of content material covered. For example, one student accurately stated the following for the Du Bois part of the graphic organizer. “People should become as educated as possible, and all people should be able to vote right now.” This student example demonstrates what was commonly found in the students’ graphic organizers on day four: students were able to accurately describe Du Bois and Washington's divergent beliefs about the best ways to address public policies connected to issues in the African American community. Additionally, students collected evidence in this graphic organizer that they used to support their arguments for the culminating writing project (Monte-Sano & Harris, 2012).
After groups completed the graphic organizer, there was a class discussion. Again, the teacher focused this class discussion on Du Bois and Washington's public policies. Students added onto their graphic organizer based on peers' comments. The completion of the graphic organizer prepared students for the culminating writing project.

**Day Five: Outlining Their Culminating Writing Project**

The teacher explained the purpose of the culminating writing project. Students independently selected one of the following dramatic monologue prompts and wrote about a page response.

1. Assume the role of either Booker T. Washington or W.E.B. Du Bois and write a historical brag (Clabough, Turner, & Carano, 2017). The brag should include Du Bois and Washington's beliefs about how his ideas helped address civil rights issues for African Americans. In other words, you are bragging as either Washington or Du Bois about his accomplishments. It should also include a little biographical information about your selected person.

2. Assume the role of either Booker T. Washington or W.E.B. Du Bois and write a brief monologue to be given like a historical press conference. The press conference should include facts about how his approaches can address civil rights issues for the African American community. In other words, you are writing a press conference speech similar to how a coach, athlete, or politician gives. Your press conference should draw upon material covered in this project.

3. Assume the role of either a supporter of Booker T. Washington or W.E.B. Du Bois and write an historical eulogy. Your eulogy should honor the accomplishments of your selected person in the area of civil rights after his death. Eulogies are given after a person dies to speak about his or her positive impact. Your eulogy should draw upon material covered in this project.

Since students had not done writing activities like these three prompts above, the teacher explained the needed contents for each. Then, students outlined their ideas. The teacher and one of the researchers circulated to help the students as they outlined their ideas. These three writing prompts allowed the students the opportunity to articulate their understanding of either Du Bois or Washington's beliefs and more importantly see how one of these civil rights activists advocated for social change (Agarwal-Rangnath, 2013). It took the students the rest of day five to complete their outline.

**Day Six: Revising and Editing Their Dramatic Monologue**

The students revised and edited their eulogy, historical brag, or press conference on day six. First, the teacher introduced two guiding questions to the students on a document camera:

1) After you read your draft, ask yourself if you communicated your person accurately, including his political positions.

2) Did each sentence make sense and did your work reflect what you have learned during this unit?

Then, she elaborated that the first question asked students to add any information that would make their writing more accurate and clear (revising), while the second question focused more on grammar and punctuation (editing). The students read through their work twice: once with the first question in mind, and again focusing on the second question. Asking students to read through their work multiple times ensured that they devoted time to editing their work to better articulate their ideas.
Day Seven: Peer Editing

Day seven focused on peer editing. The teacher reminded students of the editing done the previous day and explained that they would be reviewing each other's work. Classroom routines were already in place for students to peer edit with multiple readings, first reading and checking for punctuation and capitalization errors, reading again and correcting grammatical and spelling errors, and finally reading their peer's work a third time asking themselves if the text makes sense or if information is missing. The teacher paired students with a partner, and partners exchanged their drafts before peer-editing, using the existing classroom routine. Once the teacher returned their edited work, students made any necessary changes and wrote or typed final drafts.

Student Example of W.E.B. Du Bois Brag

Booker T. Washington and I were two of the most well-known civil rights activists in the United States. We argued with each other because Booker T. Washington thought that African Americans should go one step at a time and if we do not, little progress can be made in the area of civil rights. I know that if you follow Washington's policies that racial segregation would still be around. For example, there would still be colored bathrooms and water fountains. That is why you should follow my policies. Booker T. Washington thought that we could make compromises and if we demanded all our rights at once we would get nothing. He is wrong.

Student Example of W.E.B. Du Bois Eulogy

W.E.B. Du Bois was a great man. He used his words to fight for people's rights, got a degree from Harvard University, and worked for blacks to get the same rights as white people. W.E.B. Du Bois worked because he knew that all blacks needed more rights. He would not give up until we had all the same rights. He was like a teacher to me and inspired me to do the best I can and to never give up.

These student examples show the potential of having students write their own dramatic monologue. First, students accurately applied and conveyed content knowledge of Washington and Du Bois examined in this project. As these examples personify, they bolstered their arguments with evidence from primary and secondary sources analyzed.

Second, students articulated both Washington and Du Bois’ perspectives and values in their essay (Monte-Sano & Harris, 2012). These student examples accurately reflect Du Bois’ values about the best ways to address civil rights issues by demanding equal rights now while showing the shortcomings of Washington's beliefs that were demonstrated to be accurate with the passage of time. The economic gains for African Americans pursued by Washington could not be actualized until political progress as advocated for by Du Bois was made. Dramatic monologues are writing activities that allow students to capture and articulate historical figures' voices, values, and public policies (Russell et al., 2017). Elementary students need meaningful opportunities to discuss racial issues as well as public policies that can help to address racism in the United States (Busey & Vickerey, 2018).

Conclusion

In this article, we discuss how dramatic activities can be a vehicle for exploring W.E.B. Du Bois and Booker T. Washington's beliefs about public policies to address civil rights issues. The activities in our project actively engaged these fourth graders and allowed them to construct an essay to convey their understanding of content material examined. Elementary teachers can replicate the activities discussed in this article or analyze public policies of other historical figures by drawing on and collaborating with local actors in their communities through
dramatic plays or asking older students in a local middle or high school to serve as the actors. For example, students could explore the divergent public policies of Theodore Roosevelt, Howard Taft, and Woodrow Wilson during the 1912 presidential election. This allows students to study a famous person in Taft from Ohio history. The activities discussed in this article permit students to compare and contrast historical figures’ solutions to public policy issues.

The use of dramatic teaching activities brings historical figures from the past alive for elementary students. Students gain the skills to discern and articulate the strengths and limitations of a person’s public policy recommendations through the activities discussed in our seven-day project (Mitra & Serriere, 2015). The ability to analyze public policies is a critical skill for preparing our elementary students to be future democratic citizens (Alarcon & Bellows, 2018). The National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) argues that when students possess the ability to analyze people’s public policies that they are better able to make informed decisions to improve and help address the needs of citizens in their local community, state, and nation (NCSS, 2013).

References


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Booker T. Washington Quote</th>
<th>What does this quote mean to you?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Our greatest danger is that in the great leap from slavery to freedom we may overlook the fact that the masses of us are to live by the productions of our hands, and fail to keep in mind that we shall prosper in proportion as we learn to dignify and glorify common labour, and put brains and skill into the common occupations of life; shall prosper in proportion as we learn to draw the line between the superficial and the substantial, the ornamental gewgaws of life and the useful. No race can prosper till it learns that there is as much dignity in tilling a field as in writing a poem. (Paragraph 4 from 1895 Atlanta Compromise Speech)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important and right that all privileges of the law be ours, but it is vastly more important that we be prepared for the exercise of these privileges. The opportunity to earn a dollar in a factory just now is worth infinitely more than the opportunity to spend a dollar in an opera-house. (Paragraph 11 from 1895 Atlanta Compromise Speech)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I have always felt that Mr. Adams, in a large degree, derived his unusual power of mind from the training given his hands in the process of mastering well three trades during the days of slavery. If one goes to day into any Southern town, and asks for the leading and most reliable coloured man in the community, I believe that in five cases out of ten he will be directed to a Negro who learned a trade. (Page 121 from Up from Slavery)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In fact, one of the saddest things I saw during the month of travel which I have described was a young man, who had attended some high school, sitting down in a one-room cabin, with grease on his clothing, filth all around him, and weeds in the yard and garden, engaged in studying a French grammar. The students who came first seemed to be fond of memorizing long and complicated “rules” in grammar and mathematics, but had little thought or knowledge of applying these rules to the everyday affairs of their life. One subject which they liked to talk about, and tell me that they had mastered, in arithmetic, was “banking and discount,” but I soon found out that neither they not almost any one in the neighbourhood in which they lived had ever had a bank account. (Pages 122-123 Up from Slavery)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
W.E.B. Du Bois Quote | What does this quote mean to you?
---|---
Easily the most striking thing in the history of the American Negro since 1876 is the ascendency of Mr. Booker T. Washington. It began at the time when war memories and ideals were rapidly passing; a day of astonishing commercial development was dawning; a sense of doubt and hesitation overtook the freedmen's sons,—then it was that his leading began. Mr. Washington came, with a simple definite programme, at the psychological moment when the nation was a little ashamed of having bestowed so much sentiment on Negroes, and was concentrating its energies on Dollars. His programme of industrial education, conciliation of the South, and submission and silence as to civil and political rights, was not wholly original; the Free Negroes from 1830 up to war-time had striven to build industrial schools, and the American Missionary Association had from the first taught various trades; and Price and others had sought a way of honorable alliance with the best of the Southerners. But Mr. Washington first indissolubly linked these things; he put enthusiasm, unlimited energy, and perfect faith into his programme, and changed it from a by-path into a veritable Way of Life. And the tale of the methods by which he did this is a fascinating study of human life.

It startled the nation to hear a Negro advocating such a programme after many decades of bitter complaint; it startled and won the applause of the South, it interested and won the admiration of the North; and after a confused murmur of protest, it silenced if it did not convert the Negroes themselves. (*Souls of Black Folks* Pages 21-22)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W.E.B. Du Bois Quote</th>
<th>What does this quote mean to you?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Washington represents in Negro thought the old attitude of adjustment and submission; but adjustment at such a peculiar time as to make his programme unique. This is an age of unusual economic development, and Mr. Washington's programme naturally takes an economic cast, becoming a gospel of Work and Money to such an extent as apparently almost completely to overshadow the higher aims of life. Moreover, this is an age when the more advanced races are coming in closer contact with the less developed races, and the race-feeling is therefore intensified; and Mr. Washington's programme practically accepts the alleged inferiority of the Negro races. Again, in our own land, the reaction from the sentiment of war time has given impetus to race-prejudice against Negroes, and Mr. Washington withdraws many of the high demands of Negroes as men and American citizens. In other periods of intensified prejudice all the Negro's tendency to self-assertion has been called forth; at this period a policy of submission is advocated. In the history of nearly all other races and peoples the doctrine preached at such crises has been that manly self-respect is worth more than lands and houses, and that a people who voluntarily surrender such respect, or cease striving for it, are not worth civilizing (<em>Souls of Black Folks</em> Pages 25)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Is it possible, and probable, that nine millions of men can make effective progress in economic lines if they are deprived of political rights, made a servile caste, and allowed only the most meagre chance for developing their exceptional men? If history and reason give any distinct answer to these questions, it is an emphatic NO. And Mr. Washington thus faces the triple paradox of his career:

1. He is striving nobly to make Negro artisans business men and property-owners; but it is utterly impossible, under modern competitive methods, for workingmen and property-owners to defend their rights and exist without the right of suffrage.

2. He insists on thrift and self-respect, but at the same time counsels a silent submission to civic inferiority such as is bound to sap the manhood of any race in the long run.

3. He advocates common-school and industrial training, and depreciates institutions of higher learning; but neither the Negro common-schools, nor Tuskegee itself, could remain open a day were it not for teachers trained in Negro colleges, or trained by their graduates. (*Souls of Black Folks* Pages 25)
### Appendix C  Summary Graphic Organizer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Booker T. Washington’s Beliefs about Civil Rights Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W.E.B. Du Bois’ Beliefs about Civil Rights Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>